Emotional responses to vicarious racism among Malaysian adults

Kwok Chee Chan[1]

[1] Department of Psychology, Faculty of Behavioural Sciences, HELP University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Abstract: This exploratory study aims to address the literature gap on experiences of vicarious racism in Malaysia by investigating the essence of Malaysian adults' emotional responses to their experiences of vicarious racism. Using a hermeneutic phenomenological approach, semi-structured interviews are conducted with six Malaysian adults. Thematic analysis yielded seven themes. Experience-related themes include the witnessing of devaluing behaviours, the normalization of racism, and the relationship of participants with the perpetuator. Emotions-related themes include negative emotions stemming from disappointment with the perpetuator, emotions that guided future-oriented actions, and the use of active and passive coping mechanisms. This study could help in identifying social institutions that require anti-racism interventions and aiding the clinical field to design suitable therapies for victims of vicarious racism.

Keywords: Vicarious racism, emotions, coping mechanism

INTRODUCTION, CONTEXT AND RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

Three years ago, a shocking raw footage of the killing of George Floyd due to police brutality circulated rampantly on the Internet, sparking public outrage, especially among the African American community which led to the now-iconic "Black Lives Matter" social movement (Altman, 2020). Attention and interest towards the case and issue of racism, in general, increased significantly across many countries following the unfortunate incident (Barrie, 2020). Locally as well, following a string of cases where Indian men died under police custody, many Malaysians have taken to social media to express their anger and dissatisfaction towards the authorities for police brutality and racial discrimination towards Indians (Chen, 2021). These are but some extreme examples of high-profile racism-related cases that trended online, where people across the globe and locally watched or learned of racism, subsequently reacting in distress. Such indirect experience of racial discrimination is formally termed vicarious racism, which refers to the "second-hand experience of racial discrimination and/or prejudice directed at another individual" (Heard-Garris et al., 2021, p. 235).

Racial and cultural harmony is espoused as values in Malaysia, as suggested by many government initiatives and policies that aim to promote racial harmony (Daim, 2021). Yet, our country is plagued with racism, as evidenced by the latest formal report on racial discrimination in Malaysia by Pusat KOMAS (2021) which compiles 21 high-profile local cases of racial discrimination. With many more occurrences of unreported cases of racism, this signals the alarming frequency of indirect exposure to racism that Malaysians may experience in their lives along with its detrimental effects on a Malaysian's emotional experiences.

LITERATURE REVIEW/THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Early qualitative research on vicarious racism has demonstrated the extensive reach of vicarious racism. Truong and colleagues (2016) found that doctoral students of colour in the United States experienced racism vicariously not only through observations of racial discrimination but also merely through hearing stories of it happening. This spread of observed and learned acts of racism is aggravated by the pervasive use of the internet and social media, where incidents of racism can spread much more rapidly to a larger audience. For instance, adolescents in the United States with access to smartphones are already indirectly exposed to an abundance of racism-related news on social media and online news outlets at a young age – with many stressing that they experienced helplessness and desensitization to acts of racism (Cohen et al., 2021; Heard-Garris et al., 2021). If vicarious racism can be widespread among adolescents, it would not be a surprise if adults would be much more vulnerable to indirect exposure to vicarious racism due to their potentially greater, unrestricted access to social media and interest in news outlets, as well as their larger offline and online connections of friends accumulated throughout their lives.

Unlike the vast amount of research on direct racism, vicarious racism's impact has been less explored. Early research on vicarious racism notes witnessing racism can be detrimental to one's mental health. Truong and colleagues (2016) found that participants reported experiencing anger, depression, stress, and helplessness when exposed to vicarious racism. Additionally, vicarious racism was more prevalent among African Americans and Asian Americans during the pandemic, which correlated with increased depression and anxiety symptoms (Chae et al., 2021). This highlights two aspects: (1) vicarious racism can negatively affect emotional and mental well-being, and (2) its consequences can extend across broader demographics, not just a few individuals.

To cope with the detrimental psychological effect of vicarious racism on individuals, preliminary research shows that social support and activism are common coping strategies in

this context (Cohen et al., 2021; Heard-Garris et al., 2021; Truong et al., 2015). These qualitative studies similarly demonstrate that while the participants acknowledge their lack of power in bringing about meaningful changes to the system, they do take small steps through a social support system to help one another cope emotionally. It is evident that there is safety in numbers, as vulnerable racial minorities in these studies tend to come together to advocate against racism. As such, while experiences of vicarious racism can be distressing and traumatic, it is shown that positive coping strategies can be employed to cope emotionally at least.

Common across these studies is that for every occurrence of racial discrimination targeted towards an individual or group, there could potentially be multiple witnesses or close ones that experience it vicariously. A report by Flowers and Wan (2020) revealed that the rate of clinical depression and anxiety among African Americans throughout the country increased by about five percent (equivalent to about 1.4 million people) after the video of the murder of George Floyd surfaced on the internet. This highlights the snowball effect of vicarious racism as compared to direct experiences of racism, which justifies why it deserves more attention in scientific literature.

Social Identity Theory

To understand how experiences of vicarious racism may elicit emotional distress in witnesses, the Social Identity Theory (SIT; Tajfel et al., 1979) is drawn upon to serve as the theoretical framework. SIT posits that one's self-identity can be derived based on whether an individual interacts with others by relating with them in an interpersonal or intergroup approach (Tajfel et al., 1979). People derive their identity from their affiliation with social groups. Identification with social groups allows one to gain more social support from their affiliates, serving as a buffer against stress and promoting life satisfaction (Haslam et al., 2005).

On the flip side, the integration of social identity as part of one's personal identity may leave one sensitive to more extensive threats to the self-identity, as any threats to the social group can be interpreted as targeted at oneself too (Smith, 1999). This theory can be used to understand the experience of vicarious racism within the Malaysian context. Members of different ethnic groups (e.g., Chinese, Malay, Indian) may derive their self-identity from membership to their ethnic group. This means that when a particular member of an ethnic group is a target of racism, other in-group members who experienced it indirectly (e.g., through observation, listening through stories) may perceive those threats of racism as threats targeted at themselves.

Current Study

The literature review reveals limited studies on the nuances of vicarious racism and its emotional effects. Given that one's emotional experiences influence their daily cognitions and behaviours (Damasio & Carvalho, 2013), it is crucial to understand one's experiences of vicarious racism and the accompanying emotional responses. Due to the lack of studies on this topic in the Malaysian context, a qualitative study is best suited to explore the phenomenon of vicarious racism, as it provides rich details of participants' experiences to help researchers establish an initial understanding of a particular phenomenon (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Therefore, this study employs a hermeneutic phenomenology methodology to investigate the experiences of Malaysian adults' experiences of vicarious racism and their accompanying emotional responses. The study seeks to answer two research questions, which are "what are the lived experiences of vicarious racism among Malaysian adults?" and "what emotions are experienced alongside Malaysian adults' experience of vicarious racism?".

This exploratory study could help spearhead research interests in the effects of vicarious

racism or racism in general to understand the effects of exposure to racism on one's emotional well-being. Findings in this study can serve as preliminary evidence on whether the Social Identity Theory (SIT) can explain one's emotional distress when experiencing racism vicariously. Other than that, the participants' detailed first-hand accounts of vicarious racism-related experiences could help researchers better understand the nuances of its often-deleterious effects, rather than reducing their experiences to oversimplistic labelling of psychological conditions. As practical implications, the results could paint a picture of the internal processes of one's vicarious racism experience, which could inform the clinical field to design suitable intervention programs for people who experience vicarious racism. Participants' reports of vicarious racism can also help identify social institutions or areas where racism is rampant so that anti-racism interventions could be targeted in those areas.

METHOD

Design

This qualitative study adopts a phenomenological approach employing semi-structured interviews to gain rich and detailed insights into participants' lived experience of vicarious racism and their emotional responses to it. Phenomenology is deemed the most suitable approach in this study because it allows for an in-depth understanding of the essence of participants' vicarious racism experiences and emotional responses as an exploratory study of this understudied phenomenon in the local context (Patton, 2015). More specifically, hermeneutic phenomenology is used as I subscribe to the epistemological philosophy of interpretivism – I believe that one's knowledge only extends as far as their subjective interpretation of their everyday life (Patton, 2015). The data presented in this study reflects my interpretation of the participants' accounts and sense-making of their experiences.

Participants

The sample size of this phenomenology study is six participants, adhering to Creswell's (2013) recommended sample size range of 3 to 10 participants for phenomenological studies. A mix of convenience and purposive sampling techniques were used, such that a Google Form link iwa posted on the researcher's personal social media page (i.e., Instagram) and those who saw the posts were free to sign-up for the study via the link. However, only those who fulfilled the criteria of being a Malaysian aged 18 to 65 years old and have experienced vicarious racism through direct observation will be eligible to participate. Racial diversity among participants is also favoured by selecting an equal number of participants from the three biggest ethnic groups in Malaysia (i.e., Malays, Chinese and Indians) for diverse representation of views. The final sample consists of two Malay, two Chinese, and two Indian participants. The age range of the participants was 21 to 22 years old. The participants consisted of four males, one female, and one who preferred not to disclose their gender.

Materials

Participants' verbal responses were prompted using a series of open-ended questions asked by the researcher in a semi-structured interview. The two main interview questions that guided the research findings were (1) "talk about your experience of vicarious racism" and (2) "what were your emotional responses to your experience of vicarious racism?". Participants would be asked a follow-up question of "what are some of the ways that you cope with your emotions?" if they indicated that they cope with their emotions. Other probing questions were

asked during the interview, where necessary.

Procedure

Ethical approval for the research was first sought from the Ethical Review Board (ERB) at the researcher's university. A preliminary screening form was posted on the researcher's social media (i.e., Instagram), where interested participants learned about the study. Interested participants were required to provide their demographic and contact details (e.g., email address, phone number), as well as indicate whether they had personally experienced vicarious racism. The definition of "vicarious racism" was stated in the sign-up form. Only eligible participants, Malaysian adults aged 18 to 65 years old who have personal experience of vicarious racism through direct observation, were shortlisted for the study. The shortlisted participants were sent an email containing a link to a separate sign-up Google Form which contains the informed consent form and timeslot booking system for the interview session. Participants will be directed to the timeslot booking system only if they agree to the informed consent form. A Microsoft Teams meeting link was sent to the participants via email after they have confirmed their timeslot. Within the Teams, each participant's interview will take place in a separate, private channel (named Participant 1 to Participant 6) that was only accessible by the corresponding participant and myself. To do so, upon accepting each participant's request to join the Team, they would be specifically added into their designated channel.

Before the interview, the participants were briefed about the informed consent form again to ensure their understanding. Their verbal consent to be audio recorded was sought prior to the commencement of the interview. Participants were then given a pseudonym (P1-P6) to be addressed for confidentiality purposes. Then, the interview was recorded using Microsoft Teams' built-in record feature. After the interview, the participants were thanked and reminded that they may be contacted for clarification if necessary. They were then removed from the Team before the next interview.

Data Validation

Member checks were used by feeding back the completed transcripts to the participants for them to check if their verbal responses were accurately transcribed, especially parts where the audio recording was unclear. However, it is worth noting that the participants are not involved in the interpretation and analysis of the data, as the practice clashes with the study's interpretivist epistemological standpoint, where it is thought that there is no "ultimate truth" that the researcher and participants could verify and agree upon (DeCino & Waalkes, 2019).

Investigator triangulation was also used to promote the trustworthiness of the data. In the context of this study, a senior researcher's expertise was drawn in analysing and providing additional insight and perspective to the data analysis to allow for a more holistic view of the results. For instance, the researcher had suggested the phrasing of "active/passive coping mechanisms" in the themes, instead of my initial phrasing of "effective/non-effective coping mechanisms" – this helped eliminate my biases in ascribing values to the participants' coping methods.

Lastly, negative case analysis was performed to actively seek out potential disconfirming or contradicting experiences among the participants' accounts. Analysis of negative cases increases the credibility of the results and helps researchers understand a phenomenon more holistically, as it reveals additional perspectives and contrary explanations to be evaluated (Morse, 2015). For example, among the predominant reports of negative emotions, positive emotional responses were sought out in the participants' accounts of vicarious racism and eventually noted as one of the emergent themes.

Clarification of Researcher's Experience and Potential Biases

It is acknowledged that the inception of this study was partly due to inspiration from my personal experience of vicarious racism. In recent times, I have witnessed many exchanges of racist comments and videos of racial discrimination on various social media. While the perpetuators and targeted victims are from various ethnic backgrounds, incidents involving ethnically Chinese victims, like myself, have left the most lasting impression. I acknowledge that this may be a potential bias, as I may be unconsciously more attentive and sensitive towards racial discrimination towards Chinese participants in this study. By being aware of this potential bias as well as performing investigator triangulation, I have ensured objectivity to view all participants' accounts as equally important during the data analysis.

Secondly, my personal experience informs me that vicarious racism only evokes negative emotions, which may cause confirmation bias. However, as mentioned earlier, I employed negative case sampling to overcome said potential bias by actively seeking disconfirming evidence in the participants' responses.

While cautionary measures were taken to reduce my potential biases in interpreting and analysing the participants' responses, they are in no way an attempt to completely eliminate and bracket my worldviews and attitudes on the subject matter. The participants' recollection of their experiences of vicarious racism remains the focus of the study, but it is acknowledged that it is my interpretation of their lived experiences that are reflected in the data analysis below. As such, the results will contain my own interpretation of the participants' accounts, which may reflect my personal experiences of vicarious racism as mentioned above.

Data Analysis

The qualitative data is categorically analysed using the thematic analysis methodology. Descriptions of participants' personal accounts are categorized into emergent themes, which are summaries of the participants' experiences that may be relevant to answer the research questions. The emergent themes are then categorized into superordinate themes that serve as overall findings of the research that directly answer the research questions. After at least three readings of the transcripts, significant statements are extracted to form emerging themes that are relevant to answering the research questions. After that, patterns among the emergent themes are sought out, where related emergent themes are subsequently sorted and categorized into superordinate themes which ultimately serves as the general findings that answer the research questions. Where applicable within the findings, I will also include my own interpretation and commentary of the participants inputs to allow for a more in-depth analysis by linking parts of the participants inputs to the larger context on racism or witnessed racism.

RESULTS

Based on the accounts of participants from the three biggest ethnic groups in Malaysia, several themes have emerged that encapsulate the essence of their experience of vicarious racism and their accompanying emotional responses to it. Three superordinate themes that tie to the participants' experience of vicarious racism and four superordinate themes that outline their emotional responses to witnessing racism along with their employed coping mechanisms were identified (see Appendix A for comprehensive table of themes categorization).

The superordinate themes related to the experiences of vicarious racism are (1) witnessing devaluing behaviours stemming from the perceived inferiority of the victim, (2) normalization of racism hinders effective intervention, and (3) the relationship with the perpetuator does not reduce participants' level of distress from their acts of racism. The four superordinate themes related to the emotional responses to vicarious racism are (1) disapproval

of the perpetuator's actions elicits negative emotions, (2) emotions guided future-oriented actions, (3) participants predominantly employ passive coping mechanisms, and (4) participants occasionally employ active coping mechanism (see Table 2 for a summary of the superordinate themes).

Table 2
Summary of Superordinate Themes

Superordinate themes about participants' experiences of vicarious racism	
1	Witnessed racism typified by devaluing behaviours stemming from perceived inferiority of victim
2	Normalization of racism hinders effective intervention
3	Relationship with perpetuator does not reduce level of distress from their acts of racism
Superordinate themes about participants' emotional responses to vicarious racism	
1	Disapproval of Perpetuator's Actions Elicits Negative Emotions
2	Emotions guided future-oriented actions
3	Participants predominantly employ passive coping mechanism
4	Participants occasionally employ active coping mechanism

Witnessing Devaluing Behaviours Stemming from Perceived Inferiority of Victim

Many forms of racial discrimination were witnessed by the participants, each because of the perpetuators' perception that the victim as inferior to themselves. These devaluing behaviours include verbal abuse and the use of derogatory remarks, as some participants have noted:

So for instance, like you have people feel like the obvious one is like the 'Keling' for Indians or Tamil, and then like various types of like slurs for Orang Asals like 'Jakun' or 'Sakai' being used in a derogatory way and you know being hurled at people you know or people as in my friends, family...(P6)

I mean, the way how she described those people is like, you people, dirty people like dirty dirty, all that stuff like no sense of, I mean like never talk as if like other people got feelings like that, like very insensitive. (P2)

Other than that, many have also either witnessed their close ones bearing the brunt of negative racial stereotypes, or their close ones being the ones that stereotype others based on their ethnicity. These stereotypes are often dangerous as they generalize a negative characteristic to the whole ethnic group, implying their inferiority to the perpetuators. Across multiple participants' accounts, Indians seem to be disproportionately affected by many negative racial stereotypes. P1 mentioned "Like he always says that Indian people are super ". Similarly, P4 said Then like ahh when I say this I feel like a bit angry what they just said they also been like stereotyping the guy (an Indian) like they like quite erm lazy.

Building on the racial stereotyping of Indians, it is also a worrying sign that some authorities in the police force seem to engage in some form of racial stereotyping. This racial stereotyping is implied in police officers seemingly disproportionate suspicion towards Indians and therefore subjecting them to more scrutiny. The Indian participants reported similar accounts of their close ones and themselves being subjected to more stringent policing efforts:

… you know the police basically stopping you in your car despite you like, you know, never breaking any rules or whatever, just for the sake of looking seeming suspicious to them and like them trying to like look into your car with excessive force, you know, to attempt to like see if there's anything wrong with you when there's nothing like that. (P6)

In line with my personal experience, it is noted that racial minorities with lower structural power within society are often the victims of racial discrimination. When such a perception of inferiority occurs among perpetuators of racism, they might feel emboldened to verbally insult and develop racist attitudes and behaviours towards racial minorities. As these verbal abuses and distasteful remarks often apply to the whole racial group rather than just an individual, it is no surprise how such remarks can also bring psychological harm to other members of the racial minority who heard the unpleasant remarks indirectly.

Normalization of Racism Hinders Effective Intervention

There was a similarity among the participants' accounts that the incidences of racism were met with little intervention or resistance from both victims and them as witnesses. In fact, most have reacted casually to incidences of racism, which is a sign that racism is normalized to a certain extent. For instance, P2 mentioned using sarcastic jokes to confront his grandmother for using racist remarks against their maid and generalizing that everything she touches, including the food she cooked, is dirty.

But for me and my father, we just sometimes joke about it, like whenever my grandma say wah very dirty ah don't eat this ah, we will say 'ah ya lo we are dirty, that's why we eat this … only dirty people eat this'… (P2)

What is seemingly more worrying is that racism is normalized to a point where minorities themselves internalize racist attitudes towards them. P6, an Indian participant, reported instances where his Indian peers would accept and even use self-degrading jokes to make light of the situation as well as assimilate into the majority. P6 shared, "Call yourself like dark, call yourself as 'keling', like join in with the crowd that oppress you and make it look like a joke. Like make it look like something to normalize it, you know".

In some cases, it was witnessed that victims do not take offence from derogatory slurs used by their own friends, in which case it is taken lightly as a friendly tease.

Uh, it also depends, so the responses can range from if you're if you're somewhat closer to the said person, of course it will seem more like a tease, and they won't really take much to- they don't really feel offended. (P5)

Moreover, it was also reported by P3 that his relatives and friends brushed off and ignored the fact that he and his sister were victims of police racial profiling and microaggression. They also suggested that he and his sister should bribe the police as a solution to escape the situation, whereby bribing is an illegal practice in Malaysia.

What made the scenario even worse was that most of my relatives or friends who saw the post had responded by telling me to circumvent the solution by bribing the police officers as well, because there is the quick solution. (P3)

Here, I interpret the normalization of racism among the victims or racial minorities as fundamentally a method of de-escalation, which may occur intentionally or not. Internalizing racist attitudes and brushing off cases of racism instead of confronting the perpetuators of the racist behaviours seem to suggest an intent to avoid escalating the issue. This may be common as escalating the issue might elicit further retaliation by the perpetuators. Unfortunately, the normalization of racism causes the problem to be viewed lightly, causing less intervention and resistance towards it, leaving acts of racial discrimination to go unpunished and perpetuators potentially oblivious to their wrongdoings. Ultimately, racism continues to be perpetuated.

Relationship with Perpetuator does not Reduce Participants' Level of Distress from Their Acts of Racism

Interestingly, not only did participants recount witnessing racism targeted at their close ones, but some have also recounted instances where their friends or family members are the ones who engage in acts of racism towards others. In these cases, participants still disapproved of their actions and experienced a certain level of distress, despite their relationship with the perpetuators. In the case of P1, he mentioned that he would occasionally feel annoyed and directly confront his parents for expressing racial sentiment and negative stereotypes towards people of another ethnicity. P1 said, "Just that maybe you could consider sarcastic replies or direct confrontation could be somewhat on the annoying- like I feel a bit annoyed sometimes when they talk about it most of the time".

Similarly, P2 also vicariously experienced racism as his grandmother often hurl racist and derogatory remarks towards their maid. He mentioned his sense of discomfort when his grandmother would constantly criticize the maid, as she perceived the maid to be dirty due to her identity as a foreign worker. P2 said, "So yeah, it just it just makes everything- make the whole environment very unpleasant la, very ah uncomfortable to be in whenever she starts to open her mouth".

P4, who was acquainted with a close friend and other casual peers in a group assignment, witnessed them rejecting an individual from joining their group due to their racial identity. Even after the incident, she learnt that the group still had the same racist attitude, causing some level of emotional distress in her. P4 mentioned, "So the emotion that come out is just disappointed and angry or even though I'm not there to witness it, but when I hear it I still like wah same thing?".

Overall, we see that participants need not identify with the victim nor share a similar racial identity with the victim of racism to feel emotional distress from the experience. More importantly, participants do not condone the act of racism when it is perpetuated by their close ones. It is inferred that negative emotions elicited from witnessing acts of racism are not just a factor of shared identity with the direct victim, but rather a distaste for the act of human indecency, regardless of who the victim and perpetuator are.

Disapproval of Perpetuator's Actions Elicits Negative Emotions

From their experiences of vicarious racism, the participants have all unanimously expressed their disapproval of the perpetuator's acts of racial discrimination. As they felt that racism is morally wrong, they reportedly felt an array of negative emotions regardless of whether they were acquainted with the victims or perpetuators. For instance, P1 and P2 both expressed feelings of annoyance towards their family members for engaging in racist

behaviours.

> But sometimes when I do really wanna talk about it, ya then I would feel very annoyed myself and then I would just sarcastic towards them or just directly confront them about it, yeah. (P1)

> I vividly recall that I'm super annoyed and I'm super tired listening to the things that she said, because it is so tiring to do with emotionally because at home, when someone is arguing, it's sort of like growing the whole atmosphere like it sort of drains energy away. (P2)

Some have also experienced anger upon witnessing racism being targeted towards their family and friends. There is a distinction as to where the anger is targeted. It can be observed that P4's anger was directed towards the perpetuator, as well as the status quo that racial discrimination is still prevalent in this country. On the other hand, P6 expressed his anger and frustration towards the injustice of the fact that ethnic minorities and other marginalized communities have to endure so much oppression and bigotry.

> And even though I'm not the one that being attacked all in the situation, but I feel the fact that I'm in that situation, it make me so angry and like I just not comfortable ... For the angry is because um I feel like this whole thing is kinda like lame cuz you already living like a modern day, so I don't get why you still need to like really really be erm specific about it. (P4)

> And like it's- it's sort of builds up on top of you to the extent that, you know, you go like, ah shit, you know, wow I'm seeing this racism. (P6)

Participants have also recounted sympathizing with the victims for having to go through the distressing situations. Putting himself in his maid's perspective, P2 mentioned that he too would have lost his mind if he were to be barraged with verbal criticisms by his grandmother. Meanwhile, P3 and P5 were both saddened that their sibling and friends respectively were subjected to racism and mistreatment by others.

> So if I'm in my maid's shoes I will go crazy soon or later. I will go crazy and I will sort of- I would really hate that- ya I would really hate this person. (P2)

> I think first is I'm quite sad that my sister had to go through that experience, that's number one. (P3)

> It started- it became more of sadness and yeah, just kind of feel bad for them and I always tell myself to try my best to make them feel as comfortable as possible when I'm around them. (P5)

However, despite disapproving of the perpetuators' acts of racial discrimination, hardly any of them felt that they had the power to change the situation. P4 and P5 expressed similar feelings of helplessness due to fear of conflict with others and subsequent consequences to themselves.

> Yeah, so that's what made me angry and then I also sometimes angry at myself cuz at some point, even not angry. But I couldn't like stand up for them, yeah. (P4)

…you feel helpless because you don't want the consequences to- you don't want to have those consequences, so yeah. (P5)

In P2's case, his sense of helplessness was due to his grandmother refusing to change her discriminatory attitude and behaviour towards their maid despite being advised multiple times. Given that it is expected within the family bond and culture to respect the elders in the family, there is little that can be done to change his grandmother's racist attitude and behaviour without offending her.

I would just- I would just like- I- I don't think I think I did anything to help myself feel better because if I- if- because I tried telling my grandmother things, but then she still didn't listen so I was like so what's the point? (P2)

Here, it is interpreted firstly, the sense of helplessness as some participants felt (i.e., P2, P4 and P5) may exacerbate their psychological distress they feel because not only did they feel powerless to help their friends and family who were the direct victims of racism, they may also have felt helpless to change the racist attitudes towards their own race. Secondly, it seemed that the disappointment stemmed from the expectation the participants had for society or close ones to hold egalitarian attitudes. Such disappointment was expressed through feelings of anger and annoyance – emotions which are oftentimes not targeted at the perpetuator due to sense of helplessness or perhaps fear of retaliation (be it from strangers or their own close ones).

Emotions Guided Future-oriented Actions

Other than the negative emotions experienced by the participants in response to the immediate situation, some of the emotional responses geared them towards actions and thoughts about the future. For example, P3 and P4 experienced a sense of worry, as they reflected on the vulnerability of their close ones and themselves in becoming victims of racism in the future.

And I'm also worried on the long term, if this circumstance happens again to my sister, because like if it happens again, then your fear of that circumstance increases and you have great anxiety or more traumatized if things get worse." (P3)

Like even though most of the time it's not me that feeling or experience it, but then for me I always think like what if in future cuz this is just like the first measure, what if the future that's gonna be me? (P4)

Other than that, P6 reported feeling inspired to help other marginalized people after learning about many cases of discrimination against his own ethnic group and witnessing his own father being mistreated by civil servants. Among many reported negative emotional experiences, this deviant case illustrates that experiences of vicarious racism can motivate a positive cause.

Er yeah, it's not just as sad and like I guess painful thing, it just makes me feel like attempting to do whatever I can to help like, you know, other forms of marginalized people if I had the privilege to do so. (P6)

This account by P6 highlights the important social aspect of experiences of vicarious

racism, such that the psychological distress is mutually experienced by both the direct victims and those who experienced it vicariously. The mutual feelings of distress may cause one to empathize with another and therefore elicit intentions to protect others who are vulnerable to racial discrimination.

Participants Predominantly Employ Passive Coping Mechanisms

After experiencing mostly negative emotions, most participants employed passive coping mechanisms, where they do not actively seek ways to cope or regulate their emotions. Four out of the six participants reported reacting to their emotional responses passively. For instance, P1, P2, and P5 used methods of escapism and avoidance to distract themselves from experiencing negative emotions.

> Usually how I cope with it is that I would drown myself in like other thoughts la." (P1)I think, ok, ah the most logical way that I tried to resolve it is to escape. I try to escape, just try to not be at home. (P2)

> And yeah, just no coping mechanism, I just ignore it and I don't think about it and- and then they just go away and then next time I see something happen again. (P5)

> Other than that, P2 and P4 also reported not having any emotional coping strategies at all when under emotional distress. P2 said, "I don't think I have made any attempt to cope with it. I also don't think I have made any attempt to rectify that situation" and P4 mentioned "I most of the time feel like I don't cope with it".

> Again, it can be interpreted that most of the participants display a tendency to refrain from escalating their respective witnessed cases of racial discrimination. Perhaps, the participants were reluctant to stand up against their close ones for racially discriminating against others, especially when their close ones are more senior than them, such as P1 and P2 who witnessed their parents display racist attitudes towards others. An interesting observation though, is that P1, P2, P4, and P5 who predominantly employed passive coping mechanisms were all observing members of another race being the victims of racism. This is in stark contrast with P3 and P6 who witnessed members of their own race and family members being racially discriminated against, where their coping mechanisms are noted below.

Participants Occasionally Employ Active Coping Mechanisms

> In comparison to other participants, P3 and P6 engaged in active emotional coping strategies in attempts to ward off the deleterious effects of negative emotions from witnessing racism. For instance, P3 and P6 shared similar go-to methods of using humour to make light of their exposure to racism as members of the Indian ethnic (minority) group.

> Like whenever you're on the road, kind of sometimes like both of us jokingly speak to be each other, like who's going to pull us up next. (P3)

> Some of us like make fun of our like our experiences, you know, like how we make humour or like basically dark humour of like our experiences. (P6)

> P3 also sought social support and validation from his friends and family after he and his sister were subjected to what they perceived as microaggressions by the police as they were pulled over on the road.

But I'd say to like the- the rest of my family and like most of my friends, I would say uh it has made me feel better because at least I expressed that circumstance to the people that I care about and people who willingly give that support and assurances that I'm fine. (P3)

The difference in coping mechanism for P3 and P6 compared to the other participants may be due to both of these participants having witnessed their close ones and members of their racial group get racially abused and discriminated against, be it through verbal abuse, racial stereotyping, or microaggressions by law enforcers. Evidently, the extent of emotional distress faced would be more severe than participants who witnessed racial discrimination being targeted at outgroup members. It is also worth mentioning that P3 and P6 are ethnically Indians, which is the racial minority among the three major races in Malaysia and therefore most vulnerable to discrimination by others. As such, it would be much more helpful for them to take active steps to cope with the negative emotions by using humour and receiving social support, rather than ignoring the unpleasant situations altogether.

DISCUSSION

This study aimed to explore the experiences of vicarious racism among Malaysian adults' and their accompanying emotional responses to it. Based on the accounts of six Malaysian participants of different ethnic backgrounds, seven themes were extracted from the preceding analysis to capture the essence of the participants' experience of vicarious racism and their accompanying emotional responses. They are (1) witnessing devaluing behaviours stemming from the perceived inferiority of the victim, (2) the normalization of racism hinders effective intervention, (3) the relationship with the perpetuator does not reduce participants' level of distress from their acts of racism, (4) the disapproval of the perpetuator's actions elicits negative emotions, (5) emotions guided future-oriented actions, (6) participants predominantly employ passive coping mechanisms, and (7) participants occasionally employ active coping mechanisms.

Overall, the findings on the participants' experiences of vicarious racism and emotional response to them mostly resonated with that of past research while contributing some novel findings. Beginning with the experiences of vicarious racism, it is common among our participants to have personally observed devaluing and degrading behaviours being perpetuated against others due to the perpetuators' perceived inferiority of the victims. Truong and colleagues' (2016) study similarly found that their participants predominantly reported personally witnessing incidents of racial discrimination, with only a few reports of vicariously experiencing racism merely through hearing stories of it. Nonetheless, this research identified various racism forms, including verbal abuse, racial stereotyping, and police racial profiling – this helps pinpoint common forms of racism in different social settings and the need for interventions.

In this study, participants mostly reported developing negative emotional responses, such as annoyance, anger, sadness, and sense of helplessness – this is consistent with past literature (Chae et al., 2021; Nuru-Jeter et al., 2009; Truong et al., 2016). However, this study yielded a deviant case where a participant reported feeling inspired to help marginalized communities similarly vulnerable to oppression. This highlights that while experiences of vicarious racism may predominantly lead to negative emotional responses, it may also lead to positive outcomes such that individuals may give tangible support to others facing similar situations. Nonetheless, most participants held relatively low authority and power due to their roles as children or students, making them feel helpless in improving their circumstances and less reluctant to confront more authoritative figures (e.g., parents and teachers) despite

experiencing negative emotions.

These predominantly negative emotional responses to experiences of vicarious racism seemingly support Social Identity Theory (SIT) as a theoretical model for participants' emotional distress under such circumstances. Particularly, when participants witnessed people in their social group (e.g., family, ethnic group, friends) become targets of racism, they develop negative emotional responses such as anger and sadness. This could be attributed to individuals identifying closely with a social group that they and the victim share, resulting in perceiving any threats or negative judgments towards the social group as personal threats or negative judgments towards themselves (Smith, 1999). This may cause retaliatory responses (i.e., anger) towards the perpetuators as outgroup members and empathic responses (i.e., sadness) towards the victims as ingroup members, as they try to protect their social identity and collective self-esteem following exposure to perceived injustice against their social group. SIT also explains the deviant case where a participant feels inspired to help other similarly marginalized communities, as it prescribes that in-group members (i.e., the marginalized community) would cooperate and help one another in the face of mutual group conflict (Tajfel & Turner, 1979). As such, SIT is arguably a relevant theoretical model in explaining the far-reaching effects on one's emotions when witnessing someone in their social group become a victim of racism.

However, some findings suggest an interesting caveat in the use of SIT as a theoretical model. Specifically, some participants responded negatively when witnessing their close ones (i.e., family and friends) perpetuating racism towards others. In such cases, the participants belong to the same social group as the perpetuators (e.g., same family, peer group or ethnic group), while the victims of racism are outgroup members. Although the participants are not exposed to any threats or negative evaluations, they still disapproved of their close ones' acts of racism and developed negative emotional experiences. This participant-perpetuator relationship dynamic, seldom found in past studies, exposes SIT's limitations in explaining the participants' negative emotional responses. This perhaps hints that the dissonance of values with the perpetuator is a potential moderating factor in the relationship between the experience of vicarious racism and the level of emotional distress. Overall, SIT seems relevant only in explaining the emotional distress individuals experience when witnessing ingroup members targeted by racism, not when they are perpetuators.

Furthermore, a novel finding is the effect of the normalization of racism in complicating interventions in acts of racism. This finding goes beyond Truong and colleagues' (2016) study by not only stating that the normalization of racism exists, but also highlighting its negative effect of potentially further perpetuating racism. Like a self-perpetuating cycle, when racism frequently occurs, people gradually become desensitized by racist acts and do not intervene. Subsequently, the lack of expressed disapproval of racism will cause racism to remain as an unattended and unresolved issue. Instead, what needs to be normalized is talking about racism as a social issue, so meaningful remedial solutions can be devised.

Lastly, participants' coping mechanisms predominantly involve passive strategies, with fewer active approaches. Emotional coping strategies are important in helping them regulate their emotions when witnessing racism, as it is usually a distressing experience. While some actively seek out ways to cope with their emotional distress, such as seeking social support from close ones and using humour to make light of their situations, some default to either engage in escapism and avoidance (e.g., engaging in other activities or escape from stress-inducing situation) or having no specific coping methods. Seeking social support after experiencing racism vicariously is common as found in several past studies too (Heard-Garris et al., 2021; Truong et al., 2016). While this study found that no participants engaged in dangerous substance use as a coping mechanism, as reported by Chae and colleagues (2021), this is possibly due to the less life-threatening nature of racism that participants in this study witnessed. Anyhow, little can be said about the effectiveness of each coping strategy, which

remains a potential topic in future research.

Limitations

This study primarily fixates on the participants' emotional responses to a single incident of vicarious racism. This limits the findings to their emotional responses to only one single episode of the potentially multiple acts of racism that they may have witnessed. This may lead to less participant input on racism as a wider societal issue. Nonetheless, it was a deliberate decision to require participants to specifically talk about their most significant experience of vicarious racism, as it would allow for a more in-depth discussion and analysis about said experiences and emotional responses.

Furthermore, while the study investigates the coping mechanisms employed by the participants, it does not evaluate the effectiveness of each coping method. Though it is acknowledged that it is crucial to understand the participants' perceived effectiveness of their coping methods, it simply falls out of the scope of this study.

Lastly, the homogeneity of the participants' demographic background may have skewed the findings in the study due to their shared life circumstances. The participants were all young adults of similar age and predominantly made up of males. Their mutual life circumstances include currently pursuing their higher education and living with their parents. As such, their shared demographic background may not have allowed for a more diverse account of vicarious racism that Malaysian adults may face.

Recommendations for Future Research

Researchers can build on this study by developing a formal theory on how experiences of vicarious racism may lead to one experiencing psychological distress. While theory development is not a focus in this study, some relevant theories (i.e., Social Identity Theory and Social Identity Salience) were still drawn as probable explanatory mechanisms for emotional responses to experiences vicarious racism – drawing some signs of supporting evidence as well as some notable caveats. Therefore, further research is necessary to generate a proper explanatory framework or theory for this matter.

Moreover, researchers can add value to the literature by inquiring into the effectiveness of participants' coping strategies after vicariously experiencing racism. They are crucial to study as it provides a glimpse of which coping methods work and which do not. Qualitative and quantitative methodologies can work in tandem as qualitative studies may preliminarily seek out and understand what coping methods individuals employ, while quantitative studies can provide statistical evidence for the effectiveness of each method.

Lastly, future research can expand its lens on different forms of vicarious racism and draw comparisons between them. For instance, researchers could study the valence and intensity of individuals' emotional reactions to witnessing racism on social media as compared to witnessing it physically. This is to allow for a more nuanced investigation into the different forms of vicarious racism, subsequently facilitating better understanding of the intricate experiences of vicarious racism.

Theoretical Implications

This research was carried out to address the lack of research on vicarious racism within the Malaysian context. Being one of, if not the first study that investigates the phenomenon of vicarious racism locally, the findings serve as a cornerstone for further literature to develop upon. This is in hopes of drawing more attention to the scientific literature on the issue of

racism and its effects on the psychological wellbeing of those who are direct victims or those exposed to it vicariously. Also, the participants' detailed accounts of vicarious racism-related experiences and their emotional responses to it could help researchers better understand the nuances of its often-deleterious effects. By providing participants with the opportunity to describe and recount their own experiences, we can avoid attaching oversimplified labels and scales of psychological conditions to the victims. Furthermore, the findings support the notion that Social Identity Theory is relevant in explaining the emotional distress faced by individuals when witnessing people within the same family, ethnic group, or minority faction, in general, become the target of racism. This is important because it suggests that if individuals identify with their social groups, they will be susceptible to negative emotions when they learn of racism being perpetuated towards members of their social group.

Practical Suggestions

The ways this study contributes in terms of practical suggestions are two-fold. Firstly, the participants' accounts of vicarious racism may inform us about where racism usually occurs and subsequently where interventions should be targeted for maximum benefit. For instance, as few participants have mentioned witnessing racism perpetuated in education institutions and among law enforcers, anti-racism interventions should be specially formulated and carried out as part of high school syllabi and police training modules as attempts to alleviate the issue. Other than that, findings on the participants' emotional responses could inform the clinical field in developing effective intervention plans to help victims cope with their negative emotions. For instance, as feelings of sadness, helplessness, and worry are related to clinical depression and anxiety, therapists could use mindfulness-based therapy or dialectical behaviour therapy (DBT) to help client regulate their emotions better after witnessing acts of racism.

STATEMENT OF ETHICAL CLEARANCE
The study was cleared for data collection by the Ethics Review Board (ERB), Department of Psychology, HELP University (Ethical approval code: E202110/001). Ethical clearance granted 20th October 2021.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT
Data is available upon request from the author.

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY
I declare that the current submission is my work and is not being considered for publication elsewhere. I certify that referenced work used in this submission has been properly acknowledged in text and in the reference list.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT
The authors report no conflicts of interest.

PUBLISHER'S NOTE
The views and claims expressed in this article do not represent the Board of Editors and the Reviewers.

REFERENCES

Altman, A. (2020, June 4). Why the killing of George Floyd sparked an American uprising. *Time*. https://time.com/5847967/george-floyd-protests-trump/

Barrie, C. (2020). Searching racism after George Floyd. *Socius*, *6*, 1–3. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F2378023120971507

Chae, D. H., Yip, T., Martz, C. D., Chung, K., Richeson, J. A., Hajat, A., Curtis, D. S., Rogers, L. O., & LaVeist, T. A. (2021). Vicarious racism and vigilance during the CoViD-19 pandemic: Mental health implications among Asian and Black Americans. *Public Health Reports, 136*(4), 508-517. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F00333549211018675

Chen, H. (2021, July 21). Dozens of Malaysian Indians died in police custody. Not a single officer has been charged. *Vice*. https://www.vice.com/en/article/qj8e95/malaysia-police-brutality

Cohen, A., Ekwueme, P. O., Sacotte, K. A., Bajwa, L., Gilpin, S., & Heard-Garris, N. (2021). "Melanincholy": A qualitative exploration of youth media use, vicarious racism, and perceptions of health. *Journal of Adolescent Health, 69*(2), 288–293. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2020.12.128

Creswell, John W. (2013). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches (3rd ed.). Sage

Daim, N. (2021, February 15). PM launches Nat'l Unity Policy; praises Msians' solidarity amid pandemic [NSTTV]. *New Straits Times*. https://www.nst.com.my/news/government-public-policy/2021/02/665835/pm-launches-natl-unity-policy-praises-msians-solidarity

Damasio, A., & Carvalho, G. B. (2013). The nature of feelings: Evolutionary and neurobiological origins. *Nature reviews neuroscience*, *14*(2), 143–152. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrn3403

DeCino, D. A., & Waalkes, P. L. (2019). Aligning epistemology with member checks. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education*, *42*(4), 374–384. https://doi.org/10.1080/1743727X.2018.1492535

Eccleston, C. P., & Major, B. N. (2006). Attributions to discrimination and self-esteem: The role of group identification and appraisals. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*, *9*(2), 147–162. https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430206062074

Flowers, A., & Wan, W. (2020, June 12). Depression and anxiety spiked among black Americans after George Floyd's death. *The Washington Post*. https://www.washingtonpost.com/health/2020/06/12/mental-health-george-floyd-census/?arc404=true

Haslam, S. A., O'Brien, A., Jetten, J., Vormedal, K., & Penna, S. (2005). Taking the strain: Social identity, social support, and the experience of stress. *British Journal of Social Psychology, 44*(3), 355-370. https://doi.org/10.1348/014466605X37468

Heard-Garris, N. J., Cale, M., Camaj, L., Hamati, M. C., & Dominguez, T. P. (2018). Transmitting Trauma: A systematic review of vicarious racism and child health. *Social Science & Medicine*, *199*, 230–240. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.04.018

Heard-Garris, N., Ekwueme, P. O., Gilpin, S., Sacotte, K. A., Perez-Cardona, L., Wong, M., & Cohen, A. (2021). Adolescents' experiences, emotions, and coping strategies associated with exposure to media-based vicarious racism. *JAMA Network Open, 4*(6), 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2021.13522

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. John Wiley & Sons.

Morse, J. M. (2015). Critical analysis of strategies for determining rigor in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative health research*, *25*(9), 1212–1222. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1049732315588501

Nuru-Jeter, A., Dominguez, T. P., Hammond, W. P., Leu, J., Skaff, M., Egerter, S., Jones, C. P., & Braveman, P. (2009). "It's the skin you're in": African-American women talk about their experiences of racism. An exploratory study to develop measures of racism for birth outcome studies. *Maternal and child health journal*, *13*(1), 29–39. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10995-008-0357-x

Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (4th ed.). Sage.

Pietkiewicz, I., & Smith, J. A. (2014). A practical guide to using interpretative phenomenological analysis in qualitative research psychology. *Psychological journal*, *20*(1), 7–14. https://doi.org/10.14691/CPPJ.20.1.7

Pusat KOMAS. (2021). Malaysia Racial Discrimination Report 2020. https://komas.org/download/Malaysia_Racial_Discrimination_Report_2020.pdf

Smith, E. R. (1999). Affective and cognitive implications of a group becoming a part of the self: New models of prejudice and of the self-concept. In D. Abrams & M. A. Hogg (Eds.), *Social identity and social cognition* (pp. 183–196). Blackwell Publishing.

Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (1979). An intergrative theory of intergroup conflict. In W. G. Austin & S. Worchel (Eds.), *The social psychology of intergroup relations* (pp. 33–47). Brooks/Cole.

Tajfel, H., Turner, J. C., Austin, W. G., & Worchel, S. (1979). An integrative theory of intergroup conflict. In M. J. Hatch & M. Schultz (Eds.), *Organizational identity: A reader* (pp. 33–47). Oxford University Press.

Truong, K. A., Museus, S. D., & McGuire, K. M. (2016). Vicarious racism: A qualitative analysis of experiences with secondhand racism in graduate education. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 29*(2), 224–247. https://doi.org/10.1080/09518398.2015.1023234

APPENDIX A

Formation of Superordinate Themes from Participants' Statements

Row	No	Statement	Emergent Theme	Superordinate Themes
RQ1: What are the participants' experience of vicarious racism?				
29	2	I mean, she describe- er she never even- the way how she described those people is like, you people, dirty people like dirty dirty, ah all that stuff like no- no sense of, I mean like never- never- never talk as if like other people got feelings like that, like very insensitive.	Verbal abuse and derogatory remarks	Witnessed racism typified by devaluing behaviours stemming from perceived inferiority of victim
37	5	And I guess it's just more of uh, yeah basically accusals and maybe also throwing slurs, slangs like the K-word and things like that, calling them out for having darker skin or calling them out for their smell.		
166	5	I think I recall an incident in another class whereby this teacher of a Malay race, I think she- she was calling a bunch of Indian students the K-word and I think of course it angered people and it got, yeah I guess the school- I'm not sure what the school does, I don't think the school suspended or took any action in that regard, but I think the school just got the teacher to apologize.		
17	6	So for instance, like you have people feel like the obvious- obvious one is like the "Keling" for Indians or Tamil, and then like various types of like slurs for Orang Asals like "Jakun" or "Sakai" being used in a derogatory way and you know being hurled at people you know or people as in my friends, family, and so on so forth.		
27	3	They started to question what bag we had, they asked us what was in my bag? What was I holding? Why was I dressing in any shape or form?	Excessive policing efforts from suspicion towards victim's race	
55	6	And I feel I- I think you may have gotten this from other respondents, but I uh, you know the police basically stopping you in er your car despite you like you know never breaking any rules or whatever, just for the sake of looking seeming suspicious to them and like them trying to look out- like look into your car with excessive force, you know, to attempt to like see if there's anything wrong with you when there's- there's nothing like that.		
52	1	Like he always says that Indian people are super lazy, Indian people are super lazy.	Racial stereotyping	
145	2	So instead of looking at things objectively, she always just like ah, you are- you are this		

		this this colour, so that's why you are normally this this this.		
31	4	Then like ahh when I say this I feel like a bit angry what- they just said they also been like stereotyping the guy like ah he like they like quite erm lazy bla bla.		
56	6	And I uh and this sort thing is dis-disproportionate to us like darker skin, like Indians or whatever and what not due to the perception that, you know, we are criminals and like we're- we're- we often break- we're often drunk on the road or so on so forth, right?		
28	1	And most of the time when my parents see this kind of thing, what they would say is like a bunch of Chinese like to burn rubbish again.	Singling out victim of a particular race for doing immoral acts	
7	4	And then erm there was at one time where we need to erm be in a group by- we need to- we need to form a group and then erm after that erm before it itself, I like- I can already see that there are some people are quite selective about the member group, but the selective part is mostly on the race part itself, not about like the person capability or what.	Racial segregation	
12	5	Uh, things that happen to these people are being discriminated, as in being isolated, being teased at, being made fun of the colour of their skin, their smell, and you know, a lot of things.	Teasing	
38	5	You know all those things and then making fun of their family names because it's conveniently in their official name you know, things like that.		
80	2	But for me and my father, we just sometimes joke about it, like whenever my-my grandma say wah very dirty ah don't eat this ah, we will say "ah ya lo we are dirty, that's why we eat this, ya you're clean that's why you're what.. ah only dirty people eat this. So yep we're dirty" ya, like our- our house- our house is dirty people, so that's why we eat this so ya, if you don't like then that's all y- ya so we sort of joke about it that's- we sort of joke about it la.	Making sarcastic jokes in light of racist remarks	Normalization of racism hinders effective intervention
38	3	What made the scenario even worse was that most of my relatives or friends who saw the post had responded by telling me to circumvent the solution by bribing the police officers as well, because there is the quick solution.	Relatives not focusing on the case of police racial profiling and microaggression	
55	5	Uh, it also depends, so the responses can range from if you're if you're somewhat closer to the said person, of course it will seem more like a tease, and they won't	Victims not taking offence from derogatory slurs used by friends	

		really take much to- they don't really feel offended.		
230	6	Call yourself like a dark s-, call yourself as uh "keling", like join in with the crowd that oppress you and make- make it look like a joke.	Victims treating derogatory slurs as a joke to assimilate	
201	4	So it just- the emotion that come out it just disappointed and angry or even though I'm not there to witness it, but when I hear it I still like wah same thing?	Disappointment and anger towards friend as perpetuator	**Relationship with perpetuator does not reduce level of distress from their acts of racism**
21	2	Ah so yeah just, what- what- what used to be a normal meals turn like, just make it like, that there's no appetite for us to continue eat already because because she keeps on insisting that ah.	Lack of appetite due to grandmother's constant criticism towards maid	
30	2	So yeah, it just it just makes everything- make the whole environment very unpleasant la, very- very- very ah uncomfortable to be in whenever- whenever she starts to open her mouth.	Discomfort due to grandmother's constant criticism towards maid	
98	1	Just that I mm maybe you could consider sarcastic replies or direct confrontation could be somewhat on the annoying- like I feel a bit annoyed sometimes when they talk about it most of the time.	Annoyance and confrontation with parents when they perpetuate racism	